

**RESEARCH ARTICLE**

DOI: 10.47703/ejeb.v4i66.183



# Analysis of the Development of Creative Industries in Kazakhstan: the Qualitative Analysis

Aziza Zhuparova<sup>1\*</sup>Ryszard Pukala<sup>2</sup>Raigul Doszhan<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

<sup>2</sup> Bronislaw Markiewicz State University of Technology and Economics, Jarosław, Poland

Corresponding author:  
**Aziza Zhuparova** - PhD, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan. Email: [aziza.zhuparova@gmail.com](mailto:aziza.zhuparova@gmail.com)

**For citation:** Zhuparova, A.S., Pukala, R., & Doszhan, R. (2022). Analysis of the Development of Creative Industries in Kazakhstan: the Qualitative Analysis. *Eurasian Journal of Economic and Business Studies*, 66(4), 145-159.

**Conflict of interest:** author(s) declare that there is no conflict of interest.

## Abstract

The creative industries sector is the fastest growing in developed and developing countries. The relevance of this topic is high for countries in transition, such as Kazakhstan, which have regional specificities and political narratives. This study contributes to constructing a theory of the features of the development of creative industries in Kazakhstan. The primary purpose of the paper is to understand how organizations in developing countries deal with the complexity of a creative business. A study was conducted using the qualitative method to better understand the landscape of creative industries in Kazakhstan. A total 34 semi-structured interviews were conducted. This allowed us to understand better the type of business, the founders' activities, the financing structure, and the obstacles that had to be faced. The survey included areas such as type of business, founder activity, funding structure, and barriers to the development of creative industries in Kazakhstan to study how representatives of the sector cope with the difficulties of starting a creative business, in particular motivation about founders, factors, and obstacles to success. Overall, the results point to insufficient support from government agencies, a lack of available resources to support entrepreneurs, a lack of access to information, and a lack of skills. The results show a lack of government support and human resources. The results showed that the main problem for the development of creative industries is the brain drain from Kazakhstan, the lack of the latest technologies and materials, and their import.

**Keywords:** Small And Medium-Sized Enterprises, Kazakhstan, Semi-Structured Interview, Qualitative Analysis, Emerging Economy, Creative Economy

**SCSTI:** 06.71.41

**JEL Code:** O15, O14, L26

**Acknowledgements:** The study was carried out within the framework of Grant-funding AP08052483 of the Science Committee of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The nature of the modern economy, which is global, networked, and informational, has stimulated the concept of the creative economy. The importance of the creative economy in the modern world has been recognized in the academic and political arenas. Since the late 1990s, "cultural-creative industries" or "creative economy" has been attracting more and more attention due to their practical application and usefulness for developing the country's economy. The concept of creative industries first emerged in the UK with the decision of the British Labor government to establish the Creative Industries Task Force (CITF) (Flew & Cunningham, 2010).

Most countries consider the cultural or creative economy a key element in policy development (De Beukelaer, 2014). Initially, the development of creative industries originated in technologically advanced countries, but their influence quickly spread worldwide. Although the creative industry discourse was introduced in the United Kingdom, it soon spread worldwide, including in developed countries such as the United States, Singapore, and China. The experience of countries such as Korea, Singapore, and China, where the development of creative industries is on a trajectory unique in emerging markets, despite the lack of research on creative industries (Keane, 2016). These Asian countries have been considered the driving force behind developing creative industries in the Asian region for decades. In this regard, many states define development plans and methods of supporting creative industries.

Creative industries bring certain benefits where they are located: they stimulate regional regeneration, accelerate economic growth, increase employment, increase social inclusion and improve economic activity (UNCTAD, 2018).

Early research focuses on the experience of developing cultural and creative industries in technologically advanced countries. However, for countries with economies in transition, the lack of research on the development of the network core leads to a slowdown in the development of policies for the development of cultural and creative industries.

Kazakhstan, realizing the importance of developing creative industries, is also interested in developing creative industries in the region. The peculiarity of the development of economic institutions due to the transitional stage of development is constrained by several factors. For example, the lack of official statistics and knowledge about the development of creative industries and inexperience in this area repels transition countries from developed ones (Neuwirth, 2014). These factors lead to a lag in the development of the industry.

Kazakhstan is one of the large countries of Central Asia with an undiversified economy focused on the export of minerals; it is essential to determine the vector of development toward new technologies and creative ideas. This determines the importance of studying the factors hindering creative industries' development in Kazakhstan's developing economy.

The study's primary purpose is to analyze the features of doing business in the creative industries. It highlights the barriers and conditions for developing creative industries in developing countries.

RQ1. How are creative industries developing markets in developing countries?

Finally, we examine the motivations for and barriers to developing creative industries and make policy recommendations for such countries.

## **2. LITERATURE REVIEW**

To study the development of creative industries in developing countries, we will focus on small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). There are a number of studies suggesting that SMEs are particularly well suited to the creation and development of creative industries (Boutinot & Delacour, 2020). Moreover, empirical research confirms that creative industries require managerial thinking based on flexibility, agility and creativity, which is typical for SMEs.

An analysis of previous studies shows the difficulty in defining a unified concept of the creative economy, especially for countries with underdeveloped economies. First of all, this is due to the motives for implementing the policy in developing creative industries. In developed countries where the level of development of creative industries is at a high level, such as the countries of Western Europe, North America, and Australia, the creative economy is mainly used to restore the economy and revitalize abandoned territories, especially in industrial regions, as well as to develop innovative strategies (Grodach et al., 2017; Isaac, 2020; Pratt, 2021; Zhang & Xie, 2017). At the same time, emerging economies use their comparative advantage in cultural production costs over creating new knowledge (Evans, 2009). Therefore, it is essential to note that each country has a difference in creating cultural values and social contexts. It mainly depends on economic development, political stability, technological development, etc. (De Beukelaer, 2014). As a result, it is reasonable to predict that creative economy policies will work differently in these countries and with different results.

The research shows that the personality and motivation of founders significantly influence their ventures (O’Neil et al., 2020). The ecosystem and environment also play an important role (Landoni et al., 2019). However, previous studies have focused mainly on developed countries, and the extent to which these elements are essential for developing countries requires further study.

Thus, the following proposals were formulated:

Proposal 1 (first): Countries with developing markets have features of the development of creative industries.

Proposal 2 (second): Enterprises in the creative sector are forced to develop with limited resources.

This study identifies the main distinguishing features of the development of creative industries in a developing country like Kazakhstan. Our research contributes to the international literature on the creative industries by linking the opportunity-based view of SMEs to their survival in developing countries.

## **3. METHODOLOGY**

Using a qualitative, interpretative, and inductive approach allowed this study to be exploratory while also focused on discovering, gaining insight from, and understanding the perspectives of the study participants (Merriam, 1998).

Kazakhstan is the largest country in Central Asia, and its economic development is

primarily driven by exporting raw materials, including oil. Nevertheless, the government has been paying greater attention to developing small businesses and entrepreneurship. Because of the lack of established companies and large manufacturers in the creative industry, design and fashion develop mainly through the efforts of small businesses and individual entrepreneurs.

According to experts and market participants, there are few examples of commercially successful projects in the creative industry in Kazakhstan; however, the industry's potential is underestimated for various reasons. Moreover, the creative sector of the economy is relatively new for Kazakhstan, and it is underdeveloped; nevertheless, it has a good export potential, which may contribute to forming a positive image of the country.

Kazakhstan is a relatively underexplored context compared with other similar contexts, such as the economies of Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa. Like many other post-Soviet countries, Kazakhstan has repeatedly witnessed serious shocks: the collapse of the Soviet Union, high inflation, the transition to a floating exchange rate, and the 2007–2009 global financial and economic crisis. Before the financial crisis, the economy of Kazakhstan had been developing and showing promising signs. Still, the devaluation of the national currency, which has weakened the currency 80 times over the years of independence, hampered the country's growth. In addition, many challenges exist in the creative industries sector in Kazakhstan, including the lack of an ecosystem of great entrepreneurs and venture capitalists for new start-ups. Hence, this setting provides the range for understanding the post-penetration survival of creative industries, especially those that arise from such adverse conditions. This study explores how these organizations fostered their capacities despite challenging home environments and updated their core capabilities during and after the crisis. Given such scenarios, we believe it is time to explore the factors influencing creative industries' survival in Kazakhstan's emerging economy.

This study applied a qualitative design. We collected 34 semi-structured interviews to understand the concepts that reflect the key factors and barriers to the successful development of creative industries in a business survival environment. We followed inductive reasoning by concluding our observations (Eisenhardt et al., 2016; Mantere & Ketokivi, 2013). We follow an interpretive grounded theory approach by acknowledging interpretation in an enacted rather than purely objective world and privileging contextual understanding over a priory theory (induction) (Walsh et al., 2015). A qualitative thematic approach can gain valuable insights from key formats such as creative industry entrepreneurs (Doz, 2011). Moreover, there is insufficient qualitative research on managing creative industries in emerging markets (Birkinshaw et al., 2011).

We chose a targeted sampling technique (Welch et al., 2011) and listed 34 representatives of the creative industries who already function in the sector (Cavusgil & Knight, 2015). 34 participants participated in the interview, representing performing arts, design, craft, software, and computing systems. The survey was conducted between 2019-2020.

The main goal of this process is to draw conclusions and conduct checks within and between codes. As a tool for data analysis, we used the Nvivo 10 qualitative data analysis software (Sinkovics et al., 2008). During the analysis, the experts noted the following codes, most common among many respondents (Table 1). As patterns began to emerge

from the data, we combined codes into groups that formed categories. After the category was identified through pattern analysis (e.g., opportunities), it was further differentiated by breaking it into subcategories (e.g., marketing, technology, or management capabilities). After several rounds of iterations and comparisons between registers, we narrowed our focus to a core set of systematic enough capabilities to be acceptable. Thanks to this approach, we focused on the key opportunities that affect the survival of companies in this sector.

**TABLE 1.** Structured Codes and Definitions

Code	Definition
Financing	Financial constraints for new, innovative businesses have been the subject of much research. Financing constraints are typical among creative businesses, limiting their growth and jeopardizing their survival. The leading causes of the difficulty in raising external capital are a lack of internal cash flows and collateral, asymmetric information, and agency concerns (Block et al., 2018).
Human resources	Companies' success depends on their innovative capability (J. Henderson, 2003; Lado & Wilson, 1994; Wright et al., 1994). Creative human resources can enhance a firm's competitive advantage.
Technology	Technology is a body of knowledge that creates tools and extracts materials for implementing particular tasks to simplify our daily lives (Carpenter & Petersen, 2002). It is a powerful tool that changes people's intellectual environment and worldview (R. M. Henderson & Clark, 1990).
Networking	Networking improves management procedures and relationships while giving businesses a competitive edge (Attride-Stirling, 2001). Networks can exist within a company or between companies, and the flow or sharing of products, services, or resources, as well as the relationships between the companies, can vary greatly.
Barriers	Maintaining a business is seldom subject to the intentions that move the expected business vision (Staniewski & Awruk, 2015). Most of the time, the entrepreneur's decision results from a combination of factors and hurdles. Unfortunately, research shows that many entrepreneurs, particularly university graduates planning to start a firm, believe there are several challenges and impediments to maintaining a business and establishing one.

*Note:* Compiled by the author

## 4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Financing of creative industries in Kazakhstan. In many countries, inadequate access to external financing seriously hinders entrepreneurship development (Boix et al., 2013). First, insufficient financial resources prevent the overall progress of entrepreneurship because, at the initial stage, every business is vulnerable to financial restrictions and heavily relies on money (Ajide, 2021). Several scholars believe that finance is an important component that should be considered when allocating resources for entrepreneurial activities. (Goel & Madan, 2019).

To a high degree, financial exclusion may pose two possible economic hazards.

Financial exclusion can stifle business growth since financially disadvantaged people cannot expand their firms and achieve maximum growth. In addition, a high rate of unemployment and poverty can limit economic potential. As a result, encouraging financial inclusion in a country can directly respond to every entrepreneur's financial insecurity. Through monetary inclusion, essential financial aid can be supplied to vulnerable groups, such as micro-enterprises, poor farmers, and low-income groups. Financial inclusion programs ideally provide equal support to all economic members (Si et al., 2019).

Although Howkins (2018) describes the creative economy as a concept that depicts the economic repercussions of an idea or intangible content rather than physical capital, all creative ideas ultimately rely on physical capital to be realized. With considerable upfront capital, the transfer from intellectual substance to execution and realization is possible in the creative industries. In Kazakhstan, more financing is needed to develop creative industries.

Regarding funding for the industry, the primary funding source is the industry representatives. Interestingly, some of the respondents use their family budget or even accept help from parents:

“I cannot hide financial assistance from my parents. Everything is so in any entrepreneurial activity; first, you need to invest; only then can there be profit.”

As for state support, only 6% of respondents received funding from the state. This indicates low involvement of government agencies in the development and support of creative industries:

“In principle, the state finances. The government invests in creativity, art, and finances. So, I think there is no problem with that. Moreover, many grants are allocated for creative specialties in our country.”

However, there are times when government funding is ineffective.

The state holds a tender for creative projects. What will win the tender—this will be won by the campaign that offered the lowest price. How can there be a low price on creativity? How can art be appreciated in such a way? Therefore, it turns out that the artists have to work on their primary job and hobby—art—only in their free time because they have to feed their families. Many people break down and quit. Especially the artists, they are simply begging.

Additionally, only 5% of the representatives of this area received sponsorship. Insufficiently mature perception of the creative industry as an independent industry and the lack of confidence of sponsors in return on investment in an underexplored area are the main factors of low sponsorship.

In theory, finance is one of the business essentials that can help entrepreneurs be more effective and aligned with economic progress. The potential of Kazakhstan is immense, and it has at its disposal various levels of opportunities. Its burgeoning youth population and fast urbanization have attracted a slew of investors. Furthermore, Kazakhstan's GDP growth is among the highest in the world, even though it started from a low point. On the other hand, exchange rate volatility and commodity price decreases have caused uncertainty in the region. All these factors contribute to the complexity of doing business in Kazakhstan, particularly in the creative sector. The economy's instability leads existing companies in the creative sector to declare bankruptcy, which is already a

challenging financial situation.

Human resources. Creative individuals are at the center of venture creation in the creative industry. According to the existing literature, creative personnel use their artistic and creative sensibility to identify opportunities and provide creative products, services, or experiences. Creative entrepreneurs are those who bring together resources to exploit these opportunities as a business. The staff's talent and behavior are crucial to a creative business's success. Furthermore, research has revealed that creative professionals are enthusiastic about their work and ready to demonstrate their creativity and artistic ability.

Nowadays, in the creative sector, personal qualities are preferred. For the creative sector, it is not so much a degree of education that is important but the availability of skills such as entrepreneurship and creativity, which cannot be obtained just from a university or college. Short training courses or online platforms can also provide education and skills. Journalists confirm the dependence on the success of a creative company:

“We have a big staffing problem. However, we still carefully select personnel. We often choose creative people ready to change and develop with us. Lack of education for us is not the main obstacle in personnel selection. We can teach them everything they need to know.”

An analogous situation applies to the IT sector, which is dominant in terms of the quality of personnel:

“In our industry, it is very important to understand technologies and new directions. The relevance and timeliness of using new technologies are the engines of our business. They don't teach this at the university. That is why we teach them ourselves.”

Technological development of creative industries. Technology is integral to the development of the creative economy. In the creative professions, technology has become routine and pervasive. It is frequently utilized to stimulate creativity directly. It also adds to the life and culture of society as a whole, as Abdulla (2018) puts it, and defines ways to overcome hurdles or provide solutions to specific problems. The confluence of the Internet, computing, telecommunications, and television technologies, as well as the potential they provide for digital storage, big data, linked data, manipulation, transmission, and digital media reproduction, has had a significant impact on the creative industries (Abbasi et al., 2017).

In Kazakhstan, there is a lag in the development of technologies in many industries. Representatives of the IT sector noted that the lack of infrastructure and financing negatively affects the development of the sector in the region:

“In Kazakhstan, of course, there is a technological lag. Given that today all technologies are available, everything depends only on the capabilities of the company itself and on its financing. As such, it is no barrier to accessing technology. The same technologies are available to us as in advanced countries. The possibilities of their use are simply limited. However, it is not cost-effective even if you bring such expensive equipment. Our sales market is tiny. The population of Kazakhstan, as you know, is only 18 million people.”

Networking. The development of creative industries and information and communication technologies are interlinked. Combining creative industries and digital technologies creates jobs, opportunities, services, and products that benefit the economy.

The creative economic notion emerges when innovation is linked with various forms of creativity. The creative industries notion is used in policy texts to indicate added value, expanded market, and new jobs—all of which are critical foundations for a competitive and rising economy. Policymakers emphasize the importance of innovation, creativity, and independent thinking in the global economy.

The organization in the knowledge economy is fundamental to the discussion about the ascent of the "creative class" (Florida, 2002). Creators became standard in the mid-2000s through the philosophical headway of middle-class business, through a method of creation because of inventiveness. Networks were quickly marketed as the driving force behind job search techniques in this "new" economy when the notion of the "creative class" became widely embraced, and its relevance was heightened by the individualization and privatization of employment (Gandini, 2016). In this context, when the entrepreneurial work style is taken as the basis for building a creative career, research has shown that the development of social relations removes the critical functions associated with knowledge transfer, reputation building, and learning. Behavioral standards and the development of interpersonal trust define the urban creative "scene". As a result, the creative activity must be embedded in this "magma" of relationships and, as a result, relationships must be developed as a major aspect of their work.

A textbook example of networking comes from freelancers working in the blurred territory of the creative and technological economy. Freelancers often describe their socialization methods as a form of business interaction. For example, a freelance musician recalls that:

“Networking is more important to me today than other resources. Cooperation allows me to find clients and suppliers and discover the latest trends and directions of development in my field.”

Others, who are typically involved in more creative and artistic endeavors, describe this type of collaboration in more idealistic terms, referring to forming relationships with like-minded people as a form of community exchange centered on friendship, similar to the dynamics described earlier. A designer in her early 30s explains:

“To develop networking, you need to be confident in your activities. You need to develop a network and create business and personal relationships when working with creative people. That is, you need to make your name. To do this, you need to start talking with people. You need to get along with people and work with people you like.”

Workers must take full responsibility for their jobs and individually bear the risks of their independent careers. This context is increasingly prevalent as a casual and homeless labor market emerges. It is also linked to the rise of digital technology and social media, which have brought (at least technically) the ability to get work done anywhere, anytime, with an internet connection and have driven creative workers outside offices. According to a conductor:

“Since we work for the state-owned conservatory, we are financed by the state. Nevertheless, we should not just sit and do the job we are told. We must take responsibility for ourselves. So, last year I attracted sponsorship money through networking, and we could go to Italy for training. In addition, the networking allowed me to invite eminent composers from Russia to the master class. The headers did not tell me to do this, but I took the initiative. With the help of Facebook, I was able to do all this. I



just wrote to them on Facebook and received an answer. Thanks for networking.”

Networking allows you to find the connections you want and plays a role considered typical of the creative economy.

**Barriers.** In developing countries, it has been discovered that a creative economy fosters economic development by allowing new entrepreneurs to enter the market and grow their businesses. Extraction rises in value-added items such as recording and copyright in the creative sector, which do not recirculate in developing economies. However, the development trajectories in developing countries differ from countries with developed creative economies.

Based on interviews with 34 different founders, we identified several mechanisms that founders pursue to overcome the barriers encountered in their identity work. These mechanisms depend on the nature of the market, their reliance on digital technologies, and the founders’ perceived credibility. In addition to the financial barriers identified earlier, there are also barriers associated with human resources. As is commonly known, creative people rarely have the skills of a businessman or an investor. Therefore, there is an acute problem in the lack of relevant personnel in creative industries (e.g., marketer or an accountant) those for operations-related tasks that could be carried out free of charge on the created business sites. The most cited barrier is the lack of qualified specialists. As most respondents stated, the absence of personnel who know what to do and how to do what is necessary for the creative industry curtails its development. Thus, it is possible to reduce the threat of a shortage of specialists with professional business education and education in high technologies.

People of retirement age continue to work in some areas of local activity. As the conductor notes:

“In my team, many people with more than 30 years of experience are already retired, but there is no replacement for them. We ask them to stay until a replacement is found. We have now found a way to teach and conduct classes. After training, we sign a contract with them for a year or two.”

This barrier creates another demotivating factor which is low wages. Additionally, the local government is not interested in investing in the creative industry. According to the art director:

“Artists in our country do not attract the necessary attention. Most of the representatives of the state sector are far from art. When you go to a meeting to ask for sponsorship, they are surprised that we have such a team in the region. Then you realize that there is no point in talking further. It is very sad.”

This barrier decreases the demand for domestic products and services. Providing highly qualitative products and services helps deny the local consumers’ trust. The peculiarity of creative industries lies in their isolation of the human factor; therefore, the intellectual potential and creative abilities are far from always appreciated by the audience at the proper level. Therefore, the demand for innovative products is relatively narrow, and it is not easy to attract new customers.

In general, the creative industry is a relatively new term for locals in Kazakhstan. Because of the cultural characteristics, mentality, and adherence of the Kazakh society to traditional views, industry representatives note the immaturity of the industry’s perception as a separate branch of the economy. As a jeweler with 30 years of experience,

note:

“We started as students 30 years ago. At that time, it was unnecessary to say that this was some entrepreneurial activity or even a creative industry. Then it was just a profession. It's great that we are now singled out in a certain category, allowing us to attract more attention to our work.”

In Kazakhstan, there is still no program aimed at developing the creative sector of the economy. Nevertheless, the country has adopted the Strategy for the Development of the Creative Industries, which provides various directions for improving the activities of this industry.

“We have to rely on ourselves entirely. We are not being celebrated in any way now. We cannot even win in some contests because the jury prefers production to mass production. Moreover, our small-scale - individual production is not evaluated in any way.”

Moreover, there is no accounting for enterprises in the creative industry: it is challenging to calculate what share of GDP these industries occupy, what is the employment of people, as well as the sector's income, primarily due to the large percentage of the shadow economy. In this regard, presumably, it can be said that the state pays insufficient attention to this area in Kazakhstan. Influencer told:

“My profession is not reflected anywhere. I don't pay taxes; I don't report anywhere. I have a YouTube channel; it brings me income. I assigned it to my mother. She has her production, according to which she pays taxes. Our digital technologies do not conduct statistics in any way.”

In general, the development of the creative industries in Kazakhstan can be viewed as a bricolage (Baker & Nelson, 2005). When the resources are limited, representatives of the creative industries are more likely to conduct the study and make use of all available resources to capitalize on the most promising prospect.

The stage of development of creative industries in Kazakhstan is at an embryonic level and requires the state's active participation. The critical success factor is the active involvement of talents and creative people, the local creative enterprises and businesses in the socio-economic development of the regions through the provision of appropriate powers, participation in the process of making recommendations and developing programs, and considering the increase in personal responsibility. At the same time, at the regional level, it is necessary to gradually move to a decentralized economy, taking into account each region's advantages, opportunities, and threats. In the regions, it is important to activate the work of creative clusters, which will allow the formation of training centers and support centers for representatives of the creative sector.

While there is no systemic support for creative industries, at the same time, large-scale global competition for creative and entrepreneurial personnel is growing in Kazakhstan. According to the respondents, the creative industries are not supported by the state on a long-term basis. The lack of development programs and funding mechanisms hinders the sector's development. Moreover, the lack of support is also confirmed by the reluctance to invest in creative industries due to the high risk or low return compared to the extractive industries. In addition, developing creative industries in emerging markets requires support from the state through development and training programs, improving funding mechanisms, and preparing the appropriate infrastructure.

## 5. CONCLUSIONS

This research contributes to constructing a theory of features of the development of creative industries in Kazakhstan. The activity of creative industries in conditions of limited resources and the presence of many barriers to development and success characterizes Kazakhstan. The dynamic changes and uncertainty inherent in such an environment expose people to lessons that may apply to various fields, such as project management and entrepreneurship. Specifically, this study highlighted the significance of mentorship and inspiration in creative industries in emerging markets.

In theory, this research adds to the literature on both creative sectors and SMEs. In practice, such businesses are typical for creative industries. Educational institutions have a lot to offer in terms of training for the creative sector and individuals interested in learning a variety of entrepreneurial, project, and strategic management skills to work in the creative industries.

At the political level, proper funding and grant schemes should reflect the collaborative character of work. At the same time, essential entrepreneurial skills should be required. Strategic thinking should be encouraged when creating projects and innovations. Allocating resources for mentoring and coaching programs to foster the development of new and existing networks can also be emphasized.

In Kazakhstan, there is a significant technological backlog of creative industries. Considering that all technologies are available today, everything depends only on the capabilities of the company itself and its financing. Even though in the context of globalization, the same technologies are available as in advanced countries, many Kazakhstani creative sector representatives do not have the resources to acquire new technologies. Their uses are simply limited. It should be noted that another factor is the unprofitability of such technology since the Kazakhstan market is tiny since the population of the country is only 18 million people.

The development of globalization processes in the economy allowed Kazakhstan to become an integral part. Many respondents note that there are currently no barriers to cooperation. Especially in conditions where networks are presented as the driving force behind job search methods in this “new” economy, when the concept of “creative class” has become widespread, and its relevance has increased due to the individualization of employment. In this context, when an entrepreneurial style of work is taken as the basis for building a creative career, studies have shown that the development of social relations removes the most important functions associated with transferring knowledge, reputation building, and learning.

An example of networking comes from freelancers working in the blurry territory of the creative and technology economy. Freelancers often describe their socialization practices as a form of business interaction. For example, an independent musician recalls that networking is more important than other resources today. Cooperation allows one to find customers and suppliers and learn about the latest trends and development directions in a particular area. Others, who are usually involved in more creative and artistic endeavours, describe this collaboration in more idealistic terms. They refer to forming relationships with like-minded people as a form of friendship-based social exchange.

As a result of the analysis, it was found that the development of creative industries in Kazakhstan can be considered a bricolage. When resources are limited, representatives of the creative industries more often conduct research and use all available resources. As a result of the synergy of resources and strategic focus, creative industries are more likely to succeed in their endeavors. Consequently, the resource advantage of these entrepreneurs may be weakened by a lack of strategic interaction.

Future research might look into how collaborative bricolage is used in the creative industries and how it could benefit other industries. This research can also shed light on how people are developing creative industries in emerging markets that are characterized by resource constraints and barriers. A longer-term perspective on relationships and balancing strategic intents with mentoring abilities can also improve project management, marketing management, and other specialized management situations.

## References

1. Abbasi, M., Vassilopoulou, P., & Stergioulas, L. (2017). Technology roadmap for the Creative Industries. *Creative Industries Journal*, 10(1), 40–58. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17510694.2016.1247627>
2. Abdulla, M. R. (2018). Culture, Religion, and Freedom of Religion or Belief. *The Review of Faith & International Affairs*, 16(4), 102–115. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15570274.2018.1535033>
3. Ajide, F. M. (2022). Entrepreneurship and productivity in Africa: the role of institutions. *Journal of Sustainable Finance & Investment*, 12(1), 147-168. <https://doi.org/10.1080/20430795.2021.1939645>
4. Attride-Stirling, J. (2001). Thematic networks: An analytic tool for qualitative research. *Qualitative Research*, 1(3), 385–405. <https://doi.org/10.1177/146879410100100307>
5. Birkinshaw, J., Brannen, M. Y., & Tung, R. L. (2011). From a distance and generalizable to up close and grounded: Reclaiming a place for qualitative methods in international business research. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 42(5), 573–581. <https://doi.org/10.1057/jibs.2011.19>
6. Block, J. H., Colombo, M. G., Cumming, D. J., & Vismara, S. (2018). New players in entrepreneurial finance and why they are there. *Small Business Economics*, 50(2), 239–250. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11187-016-9826-6>
7. Boix, R., De-Miguel-Molina, B., & Hervas-Oliver, J. L. (2013). The importance of creative services firms in explaining the wealth of European regions. *Advances in Spatial Science*, 80, 387–406. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-35801-2\\_16](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-35801-2_16)
8. Boutinot, A., & Delacour, H. (2020). The progressive structuration and boundary setting of the creative industries as a scientific field. *International Journal of Arts Management*, 23(1), 4–14.
9. Carpenter, R., & Petersen, B. (2002). Is The Growth Of Small Firms Constrained By Internal Finance? *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 84(2), 298–309.
10. De Beukelaer, C. (2014). The UNESCO/UNDP 2013 creative economy report: Perks and perils of an evolving agenda. *Journal of Arts Management Law and Society*, 44(2), 90–100. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10632921.2014.895789>

11. Doz, Y. (2011). Qualitative research for international business. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 42(5), 582–590. <https://doi.org/10.1057/jibs.2011.18>
12. Eisenhardt, K. M., Graebner, M. E., & Sonenshein, S. (2016). Grand challenges and inductive methods: Rigor without rigor mortis. *Academy of management journal*, 59(4), 1113-1123. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amj.2016.4004>
13. Flew, T. (2010). Toward a cultural economic geography of creative industries and urban development: introduction to the special issue on creative industries and urban development. *The information society*, 26(2), 85-91. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01972240903562704>
14. Florida, R. (2002). The Economic Geography of Talent. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 92(4), 743–755. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8306.00314>
15. Gandini, A. (2016). Digital work: Self-branding and social capital in the freelance knowledge economy. *Marketing Theory*, 16(1), 123–141. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593115607942>
16. Goel, N., & Madan, P. (2019). Benchmarking financial inclusion for women entrepreneurship – a study of Uttarakhand state of India. *Benchmarking*, 26(1), 160–175. <https://doi.org/10.1108/BIJ-01-2018-0023>
17. Grodach, C., O'Connor, J., & Gibson, C. (2017). Manufacturing and cultural production: Towards a progressive policy agenda for the cultural economy. *City, Culture and Society*, 10, 17–25. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ccs.2017.04.003>
18. Henderson, J. (2003). Government and the arts: A framework for analysis. *Managing Leisure*, 8(3), 121–132. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1360671032000123654>
19. Henderson, R. M., & Clark, K. B. (1990). Architectural Innovation: The Reconfiguration of Existing Product Technologies and the Failure of Established Firms. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 35(1), 9–30.
20. Howkins, J. (2018). *Creative ecologies: where thinking is a proper job*. Routledge.
21. Isaac, R. K. (2020). Cultural heritage in Palestine: Challenges and opportunities. In *Cultural and Heritage Tourism in the Middle East and North Africa: Complexities, Management and Practices*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429279065-8>
22. Keane, M. (2016). Handbook of cultural and creative industries in China. In *Handbook of Cultural and Creative Industries in China*. Edward Elgar Publishing Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781782549864>
23. Lado, A. A., & Wilson, M. C. (1994). Human Resource Systems and Sustained Competitive Advantage: A Competency-Based Perspective. *Academy of Management Review*, 19(4), 699–727. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amr.1994.9412190216>
24. Landoni, P., Dell'era, C., Frattini, F., Petruzzelli, A. M., Verganti, R., & Manelli, L. (2020). Business model innovation in cultural and creative industries: Insights from three leading mobile gaming firms. *Technovation*, 92, 102084. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.technovation.2019.102084>
25. Mantere, S., & Ketokivi, M. (2013). Reasoning in Organization Science. *Academy of Management Review*, 38(1), 70–89. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amr.2011.0188>
26. Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Case studies as qualitative research*. In *Qualitative research*

- and case study applications in education (pp. 29–43).
27. Neuwirth, R. J. (2014). “Novel food’ for thought” on law and policymaking in the global creative economy. *European Journal of Law and Economics*, 37(1), 13–50. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10657-013-9415-y>
  28. O'Neil, I., Ucbasaran, D., & York, J. G. (2022). The evolution of founder identity as an authenticity work process. *Journal of business venturing*, 37(1), 106031. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusvent.2020.106031>
  29. Pratt, A. C. (2021). Creative hubs: A critical evaluation. *City, culture and society*, 24, 100384. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ccs.2021.100384>
  30. Si, S., Ahlstrom, D., Wei, J., & Cullen, J. (2019). Business, Entrepreneurship and Innovation Toward Poverty Reduction. *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development*, 32, 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08985626.2019.1640485>
  31. Sinkovics, R. R., Penz, E., & Ghauri, P. N. (2008). Enhancing the trustworthiness of qualitative research in international business. *Management International Review*, 48(6), 689–714. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11575-008-0103-z>
  32. Staniewski, M., & Awruk, K. (2015). Motivating factors and barriers in the commencement of one’s own business for potential entrepreneurs. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istrazivanja*, 28(1), 583–592. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2015.1083876>
  33. Ted Baker, & Reed E. Nelson. (2005). Creating Something from Nothing: Resource Construction through Entrepreneurial Bricolage. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 50, 329–366.
  34. UNCTAD. (2018). Creative Economy Outlook Trends in International trade in Creative Industries 2002-2015: Country Profile 2005-2014. 238.
  35. Walsh, I., Holton, J. A., Bailyn, L., Fernandez, W., Levina, N., & Glaser, B. (2015). What Grounded Theory Is...A Critically Reflective Conversation Among Scholars. *Organizational Research Methods*, 18(4), 581–599. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428114565028>
  36. Wright, P. M., McMahan, G. C., & McWilliams, A. (1994). Human resources and sustained competitive advantage: a resource-based perspective. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 5(2), 301–326. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585199400000020>
  37. Zhang, Y., & Xie, P. (2017). Creative cultural tourism development: A tourist perspective. In *Performing Cultural Tourism: Communities, Tourists and Creative Practices*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315174464>

## AUTHOR BIOGRAPHIES

\***Aziza Zhuparova** – PhD, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan. Email: [aziza.zhuparova@gmail.com](mailto:aziza.zhuparova@gmail.com), ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5787-760X>

**Ryszard Pukala** - Bronislaw Markiewicz State University of Technology and Economics, Jarosław, Poland. Email: [ryszard.pukala@interia.pl](mailto:ryszard.pukala@interia.pl), ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2943-8482>

**Raigul Doszhan** - PhD, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan.  
Email: rdd2011@mail.ru, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7480-3568>